

諸受悉皆是苦).⁷ He goes to ask the Buddha for clarification. According to SN 36. 11, the Buddha replies:⁸

Bhiksu! Concerning the impermanence of compounded things (saṅkhārānaṃ yeva aniccatam), I have said that whatsoever is felt is within suffering. Bhiksu! Concerning the perishable nature (khayadhammatam) of compounded things, their nature of decaying (vayadhammatam), fading away (virāgadhammatam), ceasing (nirodhadhammatam), and changing for the worse (vipariṇāmadhammatam), I have said that whatsoever is felt is within suffering.

In the corresponding SA 474 the Buddha replies:⁹

Because all compounded things (行) are impermanent, and all compounded things are changing by nature (變易法), I have said all feelings are suffering.¹⁰ Also, Ānanda, because of the gradual cessation (漸次寂滅) of compounded things, the gradual calming (漸次止息) of compounded things, I have said all feelings are suffering.

While the two versions differ in wording, they share the main teaching that the reason all feelings are suffering is the impermanent nature of compounded things.

Also shared in common by the two traditions is a distinction of feeling into two kinds (dve vedanā 二受): bodily feeling (kāyikā vedanā 身受) and mental feeling (cetasikā vedanā 心受). This distinction is made in SN 36. 6 and its counterpart SA 470.¹¹ The Buddha is explaining the difference between “the untaught ordinary person” (assutavā puthujjana 愚癡無聞凡夫) who feels the three feelings, and “the well-taught noble disciple” (sutavā ariyasāvaka 多聞聖弟子) who also feels the three feelings. He explains that the untaught ordinary person feels a twofold feeling, bodily and mental, while the well-taught noble disciple feels only one feeling, the bodily, not the mental. The two versions state it thus:¹²

7 SN iv, p. 216; T 2, p. 121a (CSA ii, p. 199).

8 SN iv, pp. 216-217.

9 T 2, p. 121a-b (CSA ii, p. 199).

10 Regarding this statement, see also SA 473: T 2, p. 121a (CSA ii, p. 198), counterpart of SN 36. 1-2: SN iv, pp. 204-205.

11 SN iv, pp. 207-210; T 2, pp. 119c-120b (CSA ii, pp. 193-195).

12 SN iv, pp. 208-209; T 2, p. 120a (CSA ii, p. 194).

SN 36. 6

SA 470

<p>The untaught ordinary person, bhiksus, being touched by unpleasant feeling (dukkhāya vedanāya), grieves, is distressed, laments, beats the breast, falls into bewilderment. He feels two feelings: bodily and mental. ...</p>	<p>The untaught ordinary person in whom bodily contact gives rise to all feelings, increasing all pain, and even threatening life, grieves, laments, complains, cries aloud, producing utter confusion in the mind. At that time he increases two feelings: bodily feeling and mental feeling. ...</p>
<p>But, bhiksus, the well-taught noble disciple, being touched by unpleasant feeling, does not grieve, is not distressed, does not lament, does not beat the breast, does not fall into bewilderment. He feels one feeling: bodily, not mental (so ekaṃ vedanaṃ vediyati, kāyikaṃ, na cetasikaṃ).</p>	<p>The well-taught noble disciple in whom bodily contact gives rise to painful feeling, a great pain that compels, and even threatens life, does not give rise to grief, lamentation, complaint, crying aloud, utter confusion in the mind. At that time there arises only one feeling, namely bodily feeling, not mental feeling (唯生一受, 所謂身受, 不生心受).</p>

The untaught ordinary person who has the two feelings will develop the following (in summary):

- He has repulsion for unpleasant feeling: Contacted/touched (puṭṭha/phuṭṭha 觸) by unpleasant feeling, he feels repulsion (paṭighavā 瞋恚) for it, and thus the tendency to repulsion (paṭighānusaya) obsesses/fastens (anuseti) him (恚使所使).
- He has desire for pleasant feeling: Contacted by unpleasant feeling (SA 470: by pleasant feeling), he delights in sensual pleasure (kāmasukham abhinandati). Delighting in sensual pleasure for pleasant feeling, the tendency to desire (rāgānusaya) thus obsesses him. SA 470 says that, contacted by pleasant feeling in the five sensual pleasures (五欲樂),¹³ he feels the five sensual pleasures, and thus the tendency to desire obsesses

13 Skt. pañca kāmāḥ.

him (貪使所使); also, SA 470 puts desire for pleasant feeling before repulsion at unpleasant feeling.

- He has ignorance regarding neither-unpleasant-nor-pleasant feeling: He does not fully understand the arising, the cessation, the flavour, the danger, the giving up of pleasant and unpleasant feelings, and thus the tendency to ignorance (avijjānusaya) regarding neither-unpleasant-nor-pleasant feeling (adukkhamasukhāya vedanāya), obsesses him (癡使所使).

Both texts say that, having felt each of the three feelings, the untaught ordinary person who has the two feelings is bound (saññutta 所繫) by repulsion, desire, ignorance; he is in bondage to the whole mass of birth-and-death, distress, sorrow, grief, affliction, and suffering. In contrast, the well-taught noble disciple, who has only one feeling (bodily), is without these three kinds of bondage. He feels the three feelings but is free from the bondage of repulsion, desire, and ignorance, and thus is not in bondage to birth-and-death, distress, and so on.

Thus, the two versions agree on the teachings regarding the classification of feeling into two kinds, bodily and mental, and regarding the development from pleasant, unpleasant, and neutral feeling to desire, repulsion, and ignorance respectively.¹⁴

Another discourse, SN 36. 19 with its counterpart SA 485, records a disagreement about whether the Buddha teaches only two feelings (pleasant and unpleasant) or three feelings (pleasant, unpleasant, and neither-unpleasant-nor-pleasant). The Buddha explains that he teaches feeling as being of two, three, or many different kinds. In the SN version the disagreement is between the builder Pañcakaṅga and the venerable Udāyi, and it is Ānanda who reports the disagreement to the Buddha; in the SA counterpart, the disagreement is between King Bimbisāra and the venerable Udāyi, and it is these two themselves who go to ask the Buddha which of them is right. The disagreement arises when Pañcakaṅga/Bimbisāra asks Udāyi how many feelings are spoken of by the Buddha. Udāyi says three feelings are spoken of by the Buddha; but Pañcakaṅga/Bimbisāra says that only two feelings are spoken of by the Buddha: pleasant feeling and unpleasant feeling; neither-unpleasant-nor-pleasant feeling belongs to “the pleasure that is tranquil and subtle” (santa-pañīta-sukha) or to “cessation”

¹⁴ See also SN 36. 3: SN iv, pp. 205-206, and its counterpart, SA 468: T 2, p. 119b-c (CSA ii. pp. 191-192); cf. SN 36. 4: SN iv, pp. 206-207 = SA 469: T 2, p. 119c (CSA ii, pp. 192-193).